European Committee for Homeopathy

MEETING MINUTES

COUNCIL

Meeting name/purpose	Council meeting		
Date	15.11.2020	**Time**	H 10.00 CET
Location	Microsoft Teams		
	Hélène Renoux, Arlette Blanchy, Ilse Muchitsch, Jean Pierre Jansen, Dora Pachova, , Tiziana di Giampietro, Hetty Buitelaar, Cristal Skaling-Klopstock, Margaret Wyllie, Jaume Costa, Natalia Tzima, Ileana Rîndașu	**Apologies**	Francesco di Lorenzo Daniela Hacke
Minutes to be written by	Ileana Rîndașu	**Moderator**	Hetty Buitelaar
Distribution	Council members	**Enclosures**	SC reports

AGENDA

Item	Time 1511/20	Agenda topic	Presenter
1	10:00 – 10:05	*Welcoming of new Council members*	Hetty Buitelaar/Hélène Renoux
2	10:05 – 10:35	*PR project. Follow-up of PR workshop*	Hélène Renoux/ all
3	10:35 – 11:45	*Feedback from subcommittees' meetings*	All coordinators
	11:45 – 12:00	*Coffee break*	
4	12:00 – 12:15	*Introduction agrohomeopathy working group project*	Francesco di Lorenzo
5	12:15 – 12:30	*AOB*	ALL

European Committee for Homeopathy

MEETING MINUTES

DISCUSSION OF TOPICS

1	*Welcoming of new Council members*	*Hélène Renoux / Hetty Buittelar*
	The new comers, Natalia and Ileana were greeted and briefly presented themselves.	
Conclusion	-	
2	*PR project. Follow-up of PR workshop*	*Hélène Renoux*
	Student involvement: Hélène shared information from Edward De Beukelaer, who suggested that ECH and national associations involve more medical students in events/conferences. He has had positive experiences with vet students becoming more interested in homeopathy and changing their perceptions. He has a promising contact, who is a leader of a students' organisation he invited to a homeopathic congress, and proposes that we use this contact and possibly follow this example and invite medical students to events. Hetty explained that Politics SC also discussed this and it was proposed to invite students to attend homeopathic congresses for free. Dora was asked to send a letter of invitation to the student groups in Germany, but later on it was noted that Edward invited only people who are objective or in favour of homeopathy. Jean Pierre and Jaume suggested to contact the European Students Association EMSA, member of EPHA, link emsa-europe.eu. Jean Pierre thought that we could make an approach via students from countries where homeopathy is more accepted, e.g. India, Brasil, Isreal, Swizerland, etc. These students would be more accepted by EPHA because their request would be more logical from the students perspective. It is unknown how open this organisations is to homeopathy. After Corona, setting up a summer school in the centre of the EU would be worth considering, because on there is insufficient interest at the national level.	
PR strategic narratives: Different ideas were shared on how organise a follow-up of the communication workshop on the strategic narrative. Hetty said that in the Politics SC they would like to organise a workshop for the Edu SC and Politics SC to learn more about the narratives, how to use this strategy, and to discuss the risks and benefits with Ian Wilders or someone from his team. Dora said that the Edu SC members in their majority thought that working with micro-leaders might be a dangerous issue because they also work on their own and you		

cannot control what they say.

https://ec.europa.eu/info/law/better-regulation/have-your-say/initiatives/12421-Pharmaceutical-Strategy-Timely-patient-access-to-affordable-medicines .

Another suggestion from Edu members was to focus and enter in dialogue with conventional medicine, to show that medicine is one. The whole project was not received very well by Edu SC.

Ilse shared the discussions in the Pharmacy SC and they were also not very happy, especially about the HCP narrative. Hetty pointed out that we need to give our feedback to ECHAMP because they would like to work with ECH and other organisations to increase the effectiveness of the narrative approach. Ilse proposed that we cooperate with ECHAMP and also with the EU Commission and that homeopathy could be put in as a holistic medicine. In this respect Hetty said that EUROCAM should also be implicated, as the European holistic association, but another separate discussion is needed to give it the whole attention.

Cristal said that the narratives are overarching and to be used differently in different countries. It is about how we can do this collectively, as a wider community, where we can have real impact on changing the current health narrative.

Natalia agreed that there is the need for a workshop and that we need special narratives for different audiences.

Hélène will organise the workshop, inviting all interested subcom members, introducing them the whole project and encouraging a free exchange of ideas and expectations.

Conclusion	It was agreed to organise a workshop for the ECH SC members, without the involvement of the National Associations. Ian Wilders suggested to involve in the beginning only a few people (microleaders) at the start.

Action items	**Person responsible**	**Deadline**
-Draft an invitation letter to the narrative strategy workshop	-Hélène	-

3	*Feedback from subcommittees' meetings*	All coordinators

Provings SC

Jean-Pierre reported the members decided to develop guidelines for trituration provings. The scope and content must be build up, using a questionnaire and a consensus model process.

They also decided to start a pilot project with Zeus Software (RadarOpus) to build a Practice Based Research Network (PBRN). The first project is on verification of proving symptoms. Cooperation with SC research is starting up, because verification of clinical symptoms is overlapping.

The Harmonised LMHI-ECH Guidelines for provings are checked and up to date. They show to be useful as well.

Research SC

Tiziana reported that there was an exchange of ideas between the coordinators of the three projects on what measures to implement to encourage participating homeopaths to submit new data and clinical cases. It

was concluded that the three projects will incentivize the request for participation in homeopaths through homeopathic societies, subcommittees and national coordinators.

A request was made to exhibit the three programmes on the Research space of the ECH site, which was then requested from Martin, and to have a space on the site to display the three newsletters updated periodically.
There are 25 cases of the WissHome project with very well illustrated and with interesting points for student learning.
Anna Gerstenhoefer accepted to be included among the researchers of the SC Research group to be informed and to collaborate with ECH research.
Petra Weiermayer presented that Prof Michael Frass, Dr Thomas Peinbauer, Dr Liesbeth Ellinger and herself, two human physicians and two veterinarians, have written a narrative review in the spirit of "One Health", entitled "Evidence-based homeopathy and veterinary homeopathy, and its potential to overcome the antimicrobial resistance problem - an overview", which was published in a conventional peer-reviewed journal, namely Swiss Archiv of Veterinary Medicine. The full text of the narrative review including the 3 tables can be read here:
https://sat.gstsvs.ch/de/sat/sat-artikel/archiv/2020/102020/evidence-based-homeopathy-and-veterinary-homeopathy-and-its-potential-to-help-overcome-the-antimic.html
The dean of the Vetsuisse Zuerich asked for retraction of the review and Petra Weiermayer asks for supportive letters to the editor, Dr Hans-Peter Steinmetz hanspetersteinmetz@gstsvs.ch. Christien Klein-Laansma proposed that a letter is sent in the name of ECH research subcommittee. Galen Ives offered to send a letter to the editor himself, from his position at the university.
The last hour was reserved for the joint meeting between SC Research and Provings. J.P. Jansen illustrated the project to be carried out in collaboration between the two groups.

Documentation SC
Margaret reported that Susanne will retire in June 2021; DHU will appoint a replacement, who will join the SC;
Christa Raak was congratulated on achieving her doctorate;
Carstens-Stiftung Databases; CAM-Quest still accessible but no longer updated/maintained; HomVet – Jens Behnke rejected proposal for updating;
Current Journals veterinary journals now added;
Dissertations & Theses to be indexed; ECH members asked to inform us of any new ones;
Guide to Documentation Centres almost complete – Greek information outstanding;
Link List ready to upload to website, but technical problem with plug-ins for search facility; Martin now working with Adam and Lee (who set up originally) to resolve this;
Lit Searching updating PPs;
Secure storage of master files VIP cf Martin's proposal *(post-meeting: ECH*

Council agreed to move server).

Pharmacy SC

Ilse reported on the following items from the SC:

- Short comment from the SC pharmacy **concerning Clificol - Covid-19 project presentation at GA:**
- **as in the statistics only the name Bryonia was mentioned, we pointed out the** differences between Bryonia alba and Bryonia cretica described in the German pharmacopeia (monography 2014) - the chromatogram of Bryonia dioica has 2 zones more.
- Conclusion: the binominal name should be used for HMP. The awareness of different preparation due different pharmacopoeias should be focused.
- **Implementation of the Guidelines pharmacy in praxis**
- In a first step the ECH accredited schools should be contacted via an information letter to the schools, listed on ECH website. A continuation and cooperation with SC education is scheduled on this topic. There are already 4 countries ready with the procedure of the implementation of the Guidelines pharmacy: Germany, Belgium, Czech Republic, Austria

Ilse asked about the application procedure and the necessary official steps:

To update ECH Website adding the pdf of the Guidelines for the training of homeopathic pharmacists and European Diploma in Homeopathic Pharmacy, European Committee for Homeopathy

To build a communication tool “hom pharmacy” including all interested parties.

ECHAMP - The 4 Strategic Narratives

- There should be a narrative for pharmacy and the one of research is missing
- To work on better description for pharmacists as the generalization in the scope of healthcare providers are not fitting exactly to their profile.
- To stay in contact with all stakeholders – ECHAMP + Heel + Boiron important
- All companies have their own interest and strategy.

Ilse informed about the EU Commission call :

  - Pharmaceutical Strategy - Timely patient access to affordable medicines
  - SC pharmacy commented - to follow the announcement of

results

- *Sharing contact with SC politics.*

***HMPWG**: Comments to public consultations regarding FSD, hom use lists and others – **updates;** Comments till January – start working*

EDQM: - topic European Pharmacopoeia

- To discuss a further application for EDQM working groups on behalf/ with support of ECH
- SC Pharmacy members want to apply for a Membership EDQM working groups

– working group 9 (Inorganic chemistry)
– HMM (Homoeopathic manufacturing methods)
– HOM (Homoeopathic raw materials and stocks)
- Buchheim-Schmidt: HMM, HOM
- Schwarzbach: 9, HMM, HOM)

- to participate in Pharmacopoeia monographs - important for ECH to be represented
- Comment Jean Pierre: The upcoming revision of the EU Directive, although not in 1 year but somewhat later (maybe 2 years) is a knock on the door for the availability of the nosodes. Robert Müntz, who was member of EDQM in the past, could be asked to work esp. for the nosodes, as he has personally the most extensive, direct manufacturing experience in his own nosodes lab, which was certified by the Austrian authorities. As such he is better qualified than the candidates proposed by SC Pharmacy.

RCT guidelines in medical homeopathy research - **pharmacy requirements**

- SC Pharmacy were asked to send proposals by WissHom about citation of Pharmacopoeia and the procedure of GMP or GPP.

Concerning courses, Dora asked about certifications, what does it exactly mean. She wanted the procedure to be discussed. Ilse explained the promotion information for the schools. The certifications requirements are described in the Guidelines pharmacy (see pdf for ECH council, sent before).

Hetty invites the 2 subcommittees of Education and Pharmacy to work together. Council members agreed that certification process has to be done by SC pharmacy and Edu SC according the procedure already described in the Guideline´s

Approval: content and length of courses, examination content and CVs of lecturers must be submitted to ECH Subcommittee Pharmacy for approval.

Politics SC

Natalia shared the following updates from the SC:

- New alternative mail group will be searched for; if the council can arrange this within a new mailserver later this would be more safe;
- Ask council to Set up a workshop on the Strategic Narratives idea with other/all subcommittees;
- Making contact with students association for congresses;
- Wikipedia action info is available here: https://prn.fm/wik HYPERLINK

	"https://prn.fm/wikipediawatch/"i HYPERLINK "https://prn.fm/wikipediawatch/"pediawatch/ • EU will be reviewing the Directive on Medicines: We wants at least assure the status quo and be pro-active. **Patients SC (EFHPA)** Cristal reported the following from the SC: • EFHPA (ECH Patients' Subcommittee) held their General Assembly on 7th November virtually. • Priatelia KAM a new patient group from Slovakia joined during the year; • The subcommittee has formally responded to many EU consultations on behalf of patients/users; • EFHPA (www.efhpa.eu) is very active on social media to promote positive news and useful information to the public; • EFHPA is active in EuroCAM and EPF and engaging its members across the EU in campaigns and efforts to retain and increase provision of homeopathy and CAM. **Education SC** Dora shared the following issues discussed and solved within the SC: • E-learning module: "Hahnemann – his life and work" – revised videos of the ECH e-learning module – demonstration, discussion, planning of next steps; • INTRODUCTORY Courses – discussion about opinion paper and examples of good practices • Accreditation /Re accreditation issues; • LMHI – ECH common projects - Publicity about education in ECH and LMHI Newsletters – vision, strategy, content, planning; Sharing Teaching Experience project – new strategy; • Guidelines for the training of homeopathic pharmacists and European Diploma in Homeopathic Pharmacy - first practical steps – informing schools, etc.

Conclusion	SC Pharmacy to cooperate with SC Education concerning topic Guidelines Education Pharmacy for PR and implementation within schools. SC Pharmacy to cooperate and to inform SC Politics about EU review and consultation of the Pharmaceutical Strategy and Timely Patient Access to Affordable Medicines.

Action items	**Person responsible**	**Deadline**
SC pharmacy: • To add at ECH Website the pdf of the Guidelines for the training of	Ilse	ASAP

homeopathic pharmacists • To draft a promotion letter about the Guidelines for the training of homeopathic pharmacists and European Diploma in Homeopathic Pharmacy for allied ECH schools. • To discuss with ECHAMP strategic narrative and pharmacists.	SC Edu and SC Pharmacy SC Pharmacy team	

4	*Introduction agrohomeopathy working group project*	Francesco di Lorenzo
	This issue to be discussed another time, as Francesco could not attend the meeting.	
Conclusion	Action postponed.	

Action items	**Person responsible**	**Deadline**
-	-	-

5	*AOB*	ALL
Conclusion	**Accounts & budget** The accounts and budget were not provided well enough in advance of the meeting for delegates or for the Council. It was agreed to send the accounts and budget around to the whole council one month before the GA, even if they're not fully finalized. In addition, delegates should receive information in good time, at least a week before the meeting to allowing proper review before voting.	
	Associate Membership of Berlin Akadamie The Berlin Akademie (contact person: Irene Schlingensiepen) awaits a reply from ECH to their application in Summer (or November 2019) to join as an Associate member. The council voted in Summer 2020 to accept the organisation as an Associate member. The letter was not sent. ***N.B. After this session there was an extensive e-mail discussion about this, confirming acceptance had been agreed but that communication with Berlin Akademie had not been done.***	

Action items	**Person responsible**	**Deadline**
The budget and accounts to be provided to Council one month prior to the GA for review.	Arlette	As noted.
The budget and accounts should be circulated to GA delegates a week before the meeting	Arlette	As noted.
Letter to be sent to Berlin Akademie accepting the organisation as Associate member	Helene	ASAP